



Universitat  
Pompeu Fabra  
*Barcelona*



Working Paper Series

Number 47, Spring 2021

# Representations of Ethnic Diversity. The Role of Public Institutions for Inclusionary Citizenship Practices

*Zenia Hellgren*  
*zenia.hellgren@upf.edu*

**Interdisciplinary Research Group on Immigration - UPF**  
Department of Social and Political Sciences  
University Pompeu Fabra, Catalonia, Spain  
[www.upf.edu/web/gritim](http://www.upf.edu/web/gritim)  
[gritim@upf.edu](mailto:gritim@upf.edu)

### ***Abstract***

This paper takes the case of Catalonia to inquire into how ethnic diversity is represented in the public institutions, considering both pro-diversity agendas and the actual presence of people from diverse origins in different positions. Based on data from the REPCAT project, it applies a normative approach and suggests that an increased representation of immigrants and members of ethnic minority groups is necessary in order to fulfil intercultural policy aims, and, at a broader level, that the representation of ethnic diversity in public institutions such as the education system and the police force is a democratic necessity in the superdiverse European societies of today. Focus is then shifted towards how to address the persisting underrepresentation, considering targeting or transformative measures, and to what extent there is receptiveness for a transformation towards more ethnically plural public institutions that are more representative of the whole citizenry.

### ***Keywords***

Diversity gap, public institutions, Catalonia, representation, targeting and transformative measures, discrimination

### ***Aknowledgements***

The research project REPCAT (The Role of the Ethnic Majority in Integration Processes: Attitudes and Practices toward Immigrants in Catalan Institutions) was funded by a Marie Skłodowska-Curie Individual Fellowship under Grant Agreement: 747075 — REPCAT — H2020-MSCA-IF-2016/H2020-MSCA-IF-2016. 2018-2020.

### ***Author's biographical note***



Zenia Hellgren is a political sociologist and senior migration/diversity scholar at GRITIM-UPF, where she also teaches at the Master and undergraduate levels, for instance the course “Diversity, Discrimination and Citizenship”. Currently she is Principal Investigator of the EU funded research-action project [AGREP \(Action program for effective reporting of antigypsyism and discrimination\)](#). Her main research areas involve inclusion/exclusion, intersectionality, and agency of immigrants and racialized groups, with a particular focus on discrimination. Among her most recent publications are [Racialization and Aporophobia: Intersecting Discriminations in the Experiences of Non-Western Migrants and Spanish Roma](#) with Lorenzo Gabrielli as co-author (in *Social Sciences*), and *Class, race - and place: Immigrants' self-perceptions on inclusion, belonging and opportunities in Stockholm and Barcelona* (in *Ethnic and Racial Studies*).

#### *Suggested citation:*

Zenia Hellgren (2021) “Representations of Ethnic Diversity. The Role of Public Institutions for Inclusionary Citizenship Practices” GRITIM-UPF Working Paper Series, no. 47 (Spring)  
: <http://hdl.handle.net/10230/48301>



This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License. Click [here](#) to view a copy of this license.

## Introduction

The present paper aims to contribute to contemporary scholarship on citizenship and diversity, by suggesting that an increased **representation of ethnic diversity** in public institutions constitutes a **democratic necessity** in the superdiverse European societies of today. The focus in terms of outcomes of integration and intercultural policies is thereby placed on the institutions that are dominated by the ethnic majority, and their role in potentially fostering more egalitarian and more democratically legitimate forms of citizenship practices in multi-ethnic societies (Zapata-Barrero, 2019; Yuval Davis, 2007).

This approach is based on the assumption that underrepresentation of immigrants and ethnic diversity in societal institutions hampers integration processes, as immigrants and ethnic minority groups lack both voice and visibility (Lentin, 2008; Hine et. al., 2009; ENAR, 2017; Cretton, 2017; Gans, 2017). Representation of diversity at the institutional level, in positions of power and decision-making, is expected to be crucial not the least to provide members of ethnic minority or racialized groups with role models and increase their identification with the society where they live. In accordance with Penninx and Garces Mascareñas' (2016) definition, integration is viewed as *the process through which immigrants become fully accepted as a part of society*. Here, this approach is extended to also apply to the racialized citizens of a country, in the Spanish/Catalan context primarily referring to children of immigrants and the national Roma population (Hellgren & Gabrielli, 2021). For this process to actually take place, it is assumed that the native majority society must be willing to treat immigrants and ethnic minorities as their equals (Lödén, 2008). Discrimination is considered as a likely central driver behind lacking representation of diversity, and an important obstacle for more constructive integration processes (Hellgren 2016; 2019; Safi 2012; Wu et. al. 2012; Lentin 2011, 2020; Maneri 2020).

At the conceptual level, I address the diversity gap (Zapata-Barrero, 2017) by suggesting that the representation of ethnic diversity in the public institutions of a society is necessary for the construction of a more inclusive citizenship; or an *intercultural citizenship* as proposed by Zapata-Barrero (2019). In order to situate the question of representation of diversity theoretically, I first depart from the classical concepts of descriptive and substantive representation, generally used in analyses of political representation (see, e.g., Arnesen and Peters, 2017), and distinguish between **physical representation** of diversity, meaning the actual presence of immigrants and minorities at different positions within the public institutions, and **discursive representation**, which refers to if and how ethnic diversity is incorporated in institutional agendas and publications such as school books or political party programs. Then,

I employ Nancy Fraser's (1995) distinction between *transformative and targeting measures* in assessing the potential for **institutional transformation**.

Two main research questions are asked:

- 1) What are the barriers for an increased representation of ethnic diversity in Catalan public institutions; and reversely;
- 2) What potential is there for adopting targeting and transformative measures in order to achieve greater physical and discursive representation of diversity?

Empirically, the paper is based on data collected within the framework of the REPCAT research project on the representation of diversity in Catalan institutions, conducted between 2018-2020. These data were collected through three case studies in which methodological triangulation was applied, combining interviews, participant observation, content analysis and policy evaluation in order to explore attitudes and practices related to the representation of ethnic diversity within three Catalan public institutions: the education system, the police force (*Mossos d'Esquadra*), and the political administration of the city of Barcelona. The case studies were complemented by interviews with representatives of several associations, representing the interests of different immigrant and ethnic minority communities in Barcelona.

The **REPCAT project's** main objective was to examine what **barriers** there are for the **participation/representation of immigrants and ethnic minorities in public institutions**. In order to assess the translation of intercultural discourse into practice by using the example of representation, I suggested that the autonomous Spanish region of Catalonia constitutes a particularly relevant case. In Catalonia, interculturalism has a prominent role in diversity policies, both at the level of the regional government (*Generalitat de Catalunya*) and the municipal government of its capital, Barcelona (Catalan Government, 2017; Barcelona Interculturality Plan, 2010 and Barcelona Anti-rumour strategy, 2019). Moreover, there is an increasing emphasis on equality as a central element of this agenda. At the municipal policy level of Barcelona, there is explicit recognition that equality is necessary for the intercultural political project to work in practice (Barcelona Interculturality Plan, 2010 and Barcelona Anti-rumour strategy, 2019). And in the latest version of the Catalan government's Citizenship and Migration plan (Catalan Government, 2017), the policy document that sets the guidelines for migration and integration policies at the regional level, it is explicitly stated that the possibilities for immigrants and their descendants to gain social mobility and enjoy equality of opportunities is absolutely essential to achieve the stated aim of social cohesion in diversity: a society where

citizens of many different origins share and identify with a common project. This is a basic principle of the interculturalist agenda (Zapata-Barrero, 2019). Still missing is however a more concrete account on **how interculturalism is expected to become translated into practice**, beyond the discursive level. What are the expected results of the implementation of intercultural policies? In Catalonia (as well as in the rest of Spain), the figures for how immigrants or the native Roma population score on the labour market and in the education system, or in terms of general precariousness, are indeed not very encouraging (e.g. Catalan integration report, 2016; Bayona and Domingo, 2018).

The ground for advocating for the representation of diversity in this article is clearly in line with the interculturalist agenda. Interculturalism pretends to represent a “third way” between multiculturalism’s obsession with difference and liberal universalism’s blindness to diversity. This implies rejecting multiculturalist ideas of representing diversity in the shape of parallel value systems, or viewing ethnic minority members as automatic representatives of their own minority groups (e.g. Parekh, 2000; Modood, 2011). The goal of increased representation of diversity within this framework presupposes an individualist view, where nobody with a position within a public institution is expected to be there representing only or primarily a certain group, but all members of society alike.

In this paper, I will first use theorizing from different disciplines to provide an account on the complexity of the representation idea in the context of ethnic diversity. Then, I shift focus to the feasibility of targeting or transformative measures against underrepresentation. In the Methodology section, the methodological triangulation applied in the REPCAT project will be described in more detail. Finally, in the Results section, the interviewed stakeholders’ contrasting views on diversity management and representation will be complemented by the document analysis and participant observations in order to provide an account on the complexities involved in achieving more ethnically diverse public institutions.

## **1. Theoretical Framework: The Representation of Diversity and How to Achieve It**

### ***1.1. Defining the problem with underrepresentation***

The question of **underrepresentation of ethnic diversity** is inevitably linked to that of **discrimination**, and **disadvantage**. Though it has been—and indeed often still is—taboo to talk about “race” when discussing ethnically defined social stratification in Europe (Lentin, 2008; Hine et. al., 2009), there is an emerging recognition that European societies are far from colourblind, and that whiteness tends to be privileged over non-white features (e.g. ENAR report, 2014; Cretton, 2017; Gans, 2017; Rodríguez-García et. al., 2019). Skin colour and

visible difference affect how people are treated and what opportunities they have, in Europe as elsewhere in the world (Lentin, 2008; Telles, 2014). Moreover, there is an obvious relation between racialization and class, by which racialized people are often associated with poverty and low education (Gans, 2017; Hellgren, 2019; Hellgren & Gabrielli, 2021). This in turn is related to their lacking representation in influential and decision-making positions, enforcing the negative spiral of underrepresentation>>prejudice. Immigration in Catalonia, as elsewhere in Spain, is intimately connected to this intersection between race and class, or as recently argued by Hellgren and Gabrielli (2021), to that of racialization and aporophobia. This may be understood as partly related to the Spanish and Catalan recent history of immigration, which was closely linked to a precarious labour market where migrants occupied low-paid jobs rejected by natives during the years of economic growth (Moreno & Alòs, 2015), and partly to the colonialist legacy in terms of ethnic status hierarchies that operate at a global level and influence perceptions on people as “masters and servants” depending on their ethnic and racial features (Telles, 2014; Van Dijk, 2016). This complex and multi-layered analysis is relevant in approaching the question of representation, since it may influence (often at a subconscious level) who we perceive as someone that “can represent” a public institution, for instance.

Shifting focus to **the ethnic majority’s role in maintaining racialized patterns of exclusion and subordination**, it appears reasonable to assume that the translation of intercultural policies from discourse to practice depends largely on the **acceptance and normalization of diversity** among broad layers of the ethnic majority. There has been an increasing recognition both in theory (Zapata-Barrero, 2019) and, at least in Catalonia, at the level of policy discourse (Catalan Government, 2017), that also the ethnic majority needs to participate in the construction of new collective identities, based on the intercultural premise that *all* members of society are viewed as individually different and “diverse”, with their own ideologies, religions, world views and preferences, sharing the condition that they live together and therefore need to agree on some basic premises. A basic assumption is that the **transformation of intercultural policies into intercultural citizenship presupposes egalitarian interethnic relations** (Zapata-Barrero, 2019). Such a transformation of society is only considered feasible if the majority society—both at the level of its individuals and its institutions—is committed to fully incorporate, and normalize, its ethnic diversity.

Directing focus from immigrant and minority groups towards the ethnic majority society gives rise to new questions: who forms part of this majority, and to what extent is the majority society cohesive? Creese and Blackledge (in Vertovec, 2019) refer to a contemporary Europe where “established migrant (and non-migrant) groups, as daughters and sons, grand-

daughters and grand-sons, great-grand-daughters and great-grand-sons of immigrants (and non-migrants)” negotiate their place in increasingly diverse, complex and rapidly changing societies. **An intersectional approach to diversity studies appears necessary** (Longman and De Graeve, 2014): categories defining solidarity and identification between people are complex and intertwined, and social divisions along lines as gender, class or political ideologies may be greater than those marked by ethnicity or origin in certain contexts or situations. The question of who are actually members of an imagined “ethnic majority” becomes even more complex in a societal context such as Catalonia, with significant tensions between the Spanish state and the autonomous Catalan region. When discussing “integration”, in itself a vague and often contested term, it is certainly necessary to also ask ourselves: “integration into what” (Penninx and Garces, 2016)? This is ultimately a question about who “we” are (Benhabib, 2002), and what common values we can agree on to guide our coexistence. Such questions are always inherent in any society, though they become accentuated through the enormous ethnic diversification brought about by “super-diversity” (Vertovec, 2007).

While recognizing that there certainly are many dimensions of the concept “ethnic majority” –and who self-identifies as part of it or is considered to belong to it—what is relevant in the context of this article and the research project is builds upon is mainly to approach people of non-western descent, who risk being racialized with the detrimental consequences this entails for their possibilities to enjoy equality of opportunities and identify with society. The representation of diversity—understood as both inclusive discourses and actual presence of visible minority individuals—is here considered essential to foster non-racist and egalitarian perspectives among the native majority population, as well as to provide greater opportunities to people from disadvantaged minorities.

### ***1.2. Physical and discursive representation of diversity***

In this section, I will argue that two types of representation are necessary in order to move towards greater equality in diversity, and define them as *discursive* and *physical* representation. In the vast literature on representation, this concept is generally discussed in the context of politics, and the main concern is whether minorities’ political interests (if they are assumed to have shared interests based on their condition as minority) are best represented by members of these minorities (descriptive representation), or by specific agendas that may be represented by minority or majority people alike; the political ideology/proposal/agenda is what matters, not the representative him or herself (substantive representation) (Kroeber, 2018; Hänni, 2017; Arnesen and Peters, 2017). Considering representation in institutions that are not

political, such as the education system and the police force, the difference may initially appear greater than it is. It could, for instance, be argued that unlike political representatives from traditionally excluded groups (Kroeber, 2018), teachers and police officers are not present in these institutions in order to represent any interests at all, but to fulfil a function that is presumably neutral and defined by the norms and regulations governing the institutions. Specific efforts to increase the inclusion of ethnic minorities should in that case only be considered in terms of removing obstacles for the equality of opportunities, such as discrimination. Nevertheless, in order to transform society in a direction that paves the way for actual equality of opportunities, the discourses and narratives of its institutions may need to be revised and modified (Fraser, 1995).

Zapata-Barrero has argued for the value of discourse per se, even if this discourse is not necessarily translated into the outcome that is intended by policy-makers: “normative ideas are viewed as constraining decision-making and limiting the range of alternatives that political elites are likely to perceive as legitimate” (Zapata-Barrero, 2017: 173). Thus, just as increasing support for extreme right-wing parties may be expected to increase acceptance for restrictions in immigration policies, intercultural policy discourses may serve to mainstream ideas of openness to ethnic pluralism, potentially reducing the impact of xenophobic currents (Zapata-Barrero, 2017).

The idea of **discursive representation** is similar to substantive representation, though intended to be applicable for any institution, workplace or other environment. It is a question of **how and to what extent, and from what perspectives, diversity is integrated into and mainstreamed in the discourses produced by the, for instance, institution in question.** Some practical examples could be the mainstreaming of intercultural and anti-racist approaches in training programs for future teachers and police officers; including non-western authors and scientists at university programs; or adding complexity to the national narratives transmitted through history education in secondary school by also including slave-trade, colonization and the persecution of Roma people as parts of European history (Hellgren, 2021).

**Physical representation**, instead, refers to the actual participation and representation of members of ethnic minorities in societal institutions (or other relevant contexts), supported by arguments as the **importance of role models** and the *visibility of diversity*. In practice, increased physical representation could for instance mean that we would see more teachers, police officers, local politicians or public officers of immigrant or Roma origin. While discursive representation is intended to target the ethnic majority and minorities alike, and does not per se presuppose the actual participation of minority members, their inclusion in larger



numbers through physical representation should also be expected to lead to greater discursive representation of diversity (Hellgren, 2021). Both forms of representation are here considered necessary in order to, ultimately, talk of democratic representativeness by the institutions of ethnically plural societies.

### ***1.3. Targeting vs. transformative measures against underrepresentation***

Having argued that the representation of diversity in public institutions is necessary, how could such representation become achieved in practice? An underlying assumption in this article is that such **representation** should be **socially transformative** (Fraser, 1995), as increased diversification would progressively lead to more openness, until an individual's origin or phenotype would ideally not be an issue at all during, for instance, recruitment processes.

At the European level, the potential to combat underrepresentation through policy-making may at least implicitly be found in the Anti-Discrimination Directives. However, in practice the European anti-discrimination policies have important limitations in this regard. Indeed, the massive grassroots mobilizations preceding the approval of the EU's Directives against racism and discrimination in 2000 (The Race Directive (2000/43/EC) and the Framework Directive (2000/78/EC)) could perhaps be analysed in such terms, even if it was rather a lobbying campaign by lawyers than the self-organization of racialized minority groups (Geddes, 2004; Boussetta and Modood, 2001). The success of this movement has been explained in terms of its compatibility with dominant, neoliberal EU frames: the Directives place strong emphasis on anti-discrimination as principle; however, they are silent on potential measures to actively increase the representation of immigrants and minorities, such as quotas or positive action programs (Bell, 2002). It appears that the **implementation of practical measures to fulfil the goals of intercultural and anti-discrimination agendas are highly controversial in Europe**, while there is far more receptiveness for *discourses* on interculturalism and equality.

In order to further analyse the potential strategies and receptiveness for achieving a greater representation of diversity, some comparisons with the history of claims-making for gender equality may be useful. No coordinated "migrants' rights movements" comparable to the women's movements or the US civil rights movement of the 1960s has emerged in Europe, though there are multiple networks, organizations and lobby groups against racism and discrimination, for easier access to citizenship, regularization of undocumented migrants, and increasingly, for the rights of refugees (see, for instance, the European Network Against

Racism; ENAR.org). Borrowing the structure of thought from feminist theory, parallels could be drawn to the currents of black or multiracial feminism that gained ground in the 1970s, and questioned the hegemony of white, western feminists in the global women's movements (Crenshaw, 1991; Thornton Dill and Zinn, 1996). Similar to their claim that the "universal" women's movement was in fact not universal, but representative of a western hegemony that presupposes or favours whiteness and tends to be blind to the particular forms of disadvantage affecting racialized women, the classical liberal-egalitarian approach to social justice has clearly not recognized the particular forms of exclusion affecting racialized women and men (Fraser, 1995). This has been highlighted not the least within the framework of anti-colonialist thought (e.g. Bhabha, 1994), but few have discussed what the road to "ethnic equality" could be imagined to look like in practice.

In her theoretical distinction between targeting versus transformative measures to address inequalities and misrepresentation, Nancy Fraser argued that real and lasting social change could only be achieved through the application of transformative measures (Fraser, 1995). This would for instance mean, in the case of struggles against racism and subordination of racialized groups, that efforts to combat such injustice should focus on applying general measures to improve socio-economic hardship and thereby transform the life conditions of racialized groups. Simultaneously, by integrating an anti-racist perspective in for instance education, the aim would be to change people's attitudes at a broad level. Examples of targeting measures, instead, are quotas and affirmative action programs, which Fraser sees as mainly symbolic, and in any case insufficient (Fraser, 1995).

In this paper (as in the REPCAT project), I do to a greater extent view **targeting and transformative measures** as (at least potentially) **complementary**: social transformation could also be achieved precisely through the application of targeting measures. To use a concrete example: by actively recruiting more members of underrepresented ethnic groups to positions in public institutions, as teachers, police officers or representatives of political parties, several positive—and, indeed, transformative—effects could potentially be achieved:

- i) The native majority society would become used to see ethnic diversity in its institutions, also in high positions, countering the common presumption that racialized people are "poor and uneducated" (Hellgren and Gabrielli, 2021);
- ii) The specific concerns of people from minority groups, who are often not listened to or addressed, would be more likely to become included in the institutional agendas;

- iii) People (not the least children) from ethnic minority/racialized groups would find role models who signal that they too can reach high positions in society.

## **2. Methodology**

The empirical research that constitutes the cornerstone of this project consists mainly of three case studies, one for each of the three key institutions defined above, complemented by interviews with representatives of immigrant/ethnic organizations. Within each of the case studies, methodological triangulation was applied in order to retrieve information on central aspects such as the attitudes of key persons within the public institutions and what diversity management strategies are employed in these institutions, what are the recruitment channels and procedures for employment in these institutions, or what are the perceptions on obstacles for increased representation of diversity within these institutions among stakeholders of both ethnic majority and immigrant/minority origin

The project's methodological approach is inspired by Participatory Action Research (PAR) and constructivist grounded theory. PAR emphasizes the active role of the researcher as part of the social realities that he or she studies, with the objective of contributing to social change beyond merely understanding and interpreting his or her environment (McIntyre, 2008). In constructivist grounded theory, a central element is understanding the researcher as co-producer of the results (Charmaz, 2000; Mills et. al., 2006). This means that the researcher's role, besides investigating a reality, also implies participating in the construction of this reality. The researcher interacts with and influences on his or her surroundings. In fact, by the very choice of research questions and focus, how questions are formulated and what issues are raised, the researcher contributes to set an agenda that may have several consequences for his or her environment (Aspers, 2011). In the REPCAT project, contributing to awareness-raising and to placing the representation of ethnic diversity on the agenda within the institutions in the study has been a central part of its objectives. Below follows a short description of the different methods applied:

### **A. Mapping of Diversity in Catalan Institutions.**

Mapping of the estimated representation of immigrants from non-western countries and racialized minorities was conducted in the selected institutions. Due to the lack of existing registers from which information about individuals' nationality or ethnic origin can be deduced, this information had to be gathered through interviews with representatives of the respective

institutions, with the exception being the case of the Catalan police force, who had themselves registered data on the country of birth of their police officers (which is not necessarily the same as the person's nationality; these data include Spanish nationals born abroad, who are the majority in the group of foreign-born officers (interview P3)).

### **B. Content Analysis: Discursive Representations of Diversity.**

A selection of text books used in 6th grade of primary school (age 11-12) and 3d grade of secondary school (ages 14-15) in public and semi-private (*concertada*) schools in Barcelona were analysed, together with school websites, school curricula for compulsory school and contents of the Catalan Department of Education's teacher training programs on diversity; web sites and printed informative material from the Catalan police force complemented by training material for police aspirants; websites of the City Council of Barcelona, the Catalan regional government, and the party programs of the political parties represented in the City Council of Barcelona.

### **C. Stakeholder Interviews: Different Perspectives on Diversity Management.**

Thirty-three interviews were conducted with stakeholders in decision-making positions at the Catalan Department of Education, headmasters and teachers of public and semi-private schools, representatives of the Catalan police force with different ranks and origins, politicians and police aspirants of ethnic minority background, and representatives of ethnic organizations. These interviews were transcribed and coded through the software tool Dedoose. It is important to note that the interviews were conducted within a discursive framework in which there is agreement that ethnic diversity is positive and should be promoted, in line with the intercultural policy framework that sets the agenda for diversity management in Catalan society and its institutions. There was thus no questioning of whether we should strive towards a better representation of ethnic diversity, though there was also no general agreement regarding what measures should be most fruitful in order to achieve the assumed objective of public institutions that are representative of the de facto ethnic diversity of Catalan society.

### **D. Participant Observations at Meetings and Workshops.**

This methodological task is the one that most explicitly takes on the PAR approach outlined above: the boundaries between the role as researcher and as participant, with the aim to actually influence on debates and policy agendas, are often blurred. This has not been considered to generate problems with bias given the project's explicit objective to contribute

to agenda-setting and actual change of institutional practices and attitudes, but still requires that the researcher is aware and capable of analytically separating these two functions from each other. The task consisted of the researcher's participation in twelve different meetings and seminars with key actors representing the Catalan Government, the education system, academia and policy-makers. At some of these meetings, important target groups such as school teachers, pupils and immigrant/ethnic minority families were invited. The overall objective for all these meetings was to promote pro-active diversity management at the Catalan institutional level. At some of these meetings, as the innovation camp (meeting PM 1) or the debate on diversity in education, in which I was one of the main speakers (meeting PM 7), the participant role was particularly active, while during other meetings, as EM 1-6, it was mainly to observe. The analysis of the meetings is based on transcripts of the meeting notes, which were coded by applying the same codes as for the stakeholder interviews.

### **E. Evaluation of Intercultural Policies.**

The evaluation of intercultural policies is a part of the analysis of how diversity is managed by the political administration of Barcelona. This was complemented by policies of the Catalan Government, since for instance the policies defining the education system and the police force are implemented at the regional level. Both the Catalan Government and the Barcelona City Council apply intercultural policies, whereby an open and proactive attitude towards diversity management was expected. The central task here was first to examine what policies there are that promote the inclusion of diversity, and second, perhaps even more importantly, to enquire into how and to what extent are these policies being implemented.

### **3. Results: Obstacles and Opportunities for more Ethnically Diverse Public Institutions**

Regarding the attitudes towards diversity, all of the interviewed stakeholders explicitly defined themselves as positive towards the idea of increased ethnic diversity in the institutions, though one of them added that gender equality was considered "more of a priority at present" (interview E9). Particularly the representatives of the Catalan police force expressed awareness that the police must represent the broader population, both in terms of gender and ethnicity (interviews P1-P7). There are however subtler dimensions of what attitudes towards diversity are transmitted by an institution than to simply declare itself as "pro-diversity". For instance, there is an **institutional collective identity**, which may be much taken for granted by members of the ethnic majority, but be perceived as exclusionary for people of other origins. This

perception was central among the interviewed ethnic minority representatives, as expressed by this scholar and activist of ethnic minority origin:

“The problem is that there is this clearly defined notion of who is Catalan, and when there is such a clearly defined notion it is very difficult for an outsider to be accepted as Catalan. I went to a talk organized by the Generalitat and said that perhaps it’s not about trying to become, but to stop being Catalan, for everyone... when we cease being something fixed, we can all start becoming something else. [...] But the institutions...they have a defined standard for who can represent them, and who cannot.” M8, interview 2019

All the stakeholders who were interviewed for the REPCAT project were asked if they consider that there is a general problem with racism or discrimination in the Catalan institutions, and in Catalan society. Most answered yes in the second case; a typical approach is reflected by this respondent: “yes, [there is a general problem with racism] in Catalonia, as in the rest of the world” (interview P6). As for the institutions, however, few respondents would explicitly consider them racist or discriminatory, though several responded that the institutions reflect prevalent attitudes in society overall, which still needs to become more used to ethnic diversity (e.g. interviews P1, P2, P3, E1, E2, M2, M3, M7). Consider this quote by a public servant, herself of African origin and member of a large Catalan public institution, who defines the Catalan institutions as “unconsciously racist”, and underlines the importance of people in central positions with a real willingness to change status quo:

“There are very few people with a minimum degree of sensitivity who actually try to improve public policies. Generally, I’d say that yes, the institutions are racist, but they are unconsciously racist. I will give you an example of something that happened to me, to show what I mean. I was singing in a choir and we collaborated with a women’s prison, singing with the prisoners. During a choir practice in the prison, the staff assumed I was a prisoner and yelled at me as I went up the stairs, screaming ‘you cannot be there’. I told my colleagues about this and they laughed. And I told them, ‘no, this is serious’. And they replied, ‘but don’t take it personally’. And I answered back that when they work with a black person, they must be aware of the prejudices that affect us. I did take it very seriously, it was hurtful. [...] There is a lot of work to be done, a lot of awareness-raising.” M4, interview 2020

In the rest of this section, the findings of the mapping of diversity in the Catalan education system, police force and political administration of Barcelona will first be summarized, before engaging in the central question of how measures against underrepresentation are considered by the different actors involved.

### ***3.1. Physical and discursive representation in the Catalan public institutions***

#### ***The education system***

The REPCAT project was based on the view that the experiences children of different origins have from their schooling are fundamental for the relationship they develop with society as a whole, as well as for how they manage to assimilate knowledge, and what opportunities they will have in life after their school years. This is confirmed by earlier research on the school failure of immigrant and Roma children, in Europe and the US as well as at the national level of Spain, and Catalonia (e.g. Bayona and Domingo, 2018; Martín Criado, 2018; Bereményi and Carrasco, 2015, 2017; O’Hanlon 2016; Miskovic, 2009). The potential explanations generally include both the socio-economic marginalization that people from these groups often live in, the low educational level of the parents, and overall “integration difficulties”. In the Spanish/Catalan context, it is often argued that Roma and immigrant children and their families are not engaged in the school activities and do not seem to identify with the school. The reasons for school failure are thus looked for among the families themselves, their values and presumed shortcomings in the educational support of their children (Bereményi and Carrasco, 2015, 2017; Paniaigua and Bereményi, 2019). Much less attention has been given to the education system itself and how it operates to create inclusion or exclusion of the pupils. Is the actual ethnic and cultural diversity of society transmitted through the school material used? Is there a relationship between lacking representation of diversity among school staff and in text books, and the disproportionately high rates of school failure among minority students (Bayona and Domingo, 2018)?

The **mapping of diversity representation in the education system** aimed at covering two dimensions, consistent with the distinction between physical and discursive representation that was outlined in the theory section. First, it aimed to figure out whether and to what extent there are teachers and other school staff of diverse origins, or whether the vast majority represents the white, native majority middle-class that often is implicitly understood as the “norm citizenry”. This was challenging, as there is no ethnic registration in Spain. To keep such registers would be illegal, which is currently a matter for debate and some contestation: there are, for instance, anti-racist actors who claim that it may be necessary to register ethnicity in order to detect and prove discrimination (interviews M4 and M5). According to the interviewed directors at the Catalan Department of Education, it is impossible to know how many teachers have immigrant or Roma origin in Catalonia. Many people with immigrant backgrounds are naturalized Spanish citizens and no longer figure in migration statistics (while ethnic registers are thus not permitted, there are official registers of country of birth for legally residing non-

citizens). They do however state that “teachers are in general ethnically Catalan, or Spanish” (interviews E1-E2), a view that was unanimously confirmed by the interviewed headmasters and teachers (interviews E4-E8). Several of the interviewed ethnic minority representatives highlighted how important role models such as teachers of diverse backgrounds are also in terms of avoiding racial biases in schools. One participant at a meeting on diversity in education puts it this way:

“The main problem is not that our children may suffer racism in schools but the structural racism that is everywhere, in attitudes, in the text books. The school system is dominated by those who consider a certain group of people, the Catalan middle and upper classes, as ‘normal’ [...] There are fantastic people working in the schools, but there are also teachers who are very racist. And it is enough with one or two of these to make your life impossible. If you have a racist teacher, then that is enough to destroy a child’s educational career, he or she will only think of quitting school as soon as possible”. *Immigrant reception worker and PhD Candidate, meeting EM 2*

Second, the discursive level was addressed by an analysis of official Catalan school curricula, teacher training programs, and text books used in history, social sciences and religion/ethical values courses during the last year of primary school (sixth grade) and the third grade in compulsory secondary school (3d of ESO). The importance of what values are transmitted to children and youth through educational material has been highlighted in education research (Horst and Gitz-Johansen, 2010). The analysis concluded that though the content on migration and diversity in official curricula and teacher training programs is nuanced, respectful and reflects the complexity of the matters well, and the Department of Education promotes interculturalism in education through programs promoting linguistic and cultural pluralism, it is problematic that its implementation by individual schools and teachers is optional (Hellgren 2021). In practice, this means that a **“diversity mainstreaming” of the education system is not guaranteed**. Regarding the text book analysis, it concluded that there is generally very little, if any, mention of migration and diversity, racism, or discrimination. There is also no mention whatsoever of the Roma people in any of the books analysed, which may be considered remarkable though it is consistent with O’Hanlon (2016: 7) as she links school abandonment and absenteeism with lacking representation: “Roma students aren’t in the classrooms, and their history isn’t in textbooks: 500 years of Roma contributions to Spain fails to merit a single mention in school history books”.

School curricula declare in general terms that education should comply with basic intercultural principles, but there is no control of if and how this is done in the schools, nor is



there any evaluation of the text books or other educational material used. One of the interviewed directors at the Department of Education explicitly stated that in the view of this institution, interculturalism should be promoted but cannot be imposed on schools (interview E1).

### The police force

Just as in police forces across European countries, where studies show that diversity is low among new recruits and diminishes as police officers' rank rises (Van Ewijk, 2011a and b), there is a **huge diversity gap** in the Catalan police force. According to recent data, 130 out of 17,000 Catalan police officers (Mossos d'Esquadra) are foreign-born (including ethnic Spaniards born abroad); that is, 0,76% (P3, interview 2019). The interviewed representatives of the Catalan Police Force and the Police Academy agree that there is a problem with representation, but not with racism, within the police (interviews P1-P5).

In 2007-2008, there was a specific recruitment campaign addressing people of diverse origins to register for the access tests to the Police Academy; the Program for social diversification (Catalan Government, 2007). The results of the campaign were bleak: out of the 53 initial aspirants in 2007, only 3 passed all the tests: theory, physical training and psychological evaluation. In 2008, only 1 candidate of the initial 58 aspirants of foreign background who tried to access the Catalan Police Academy as a part of this program was admitted (internal documentation provided by the Catalan Police Direction). The police direction explains this by the fact that applicants with a foreign background, of whom few meet the formal criteria to apply in the first place, have difficulties passing the tests (interviews P1-P5). Similarly, various representatives of the Catalan education system explained the lack of diversity among teachers with the fact that very few make it to the university, indicating that the **root causes of underrepresentation** need to be searched for also in deeper, structural inequalities, beyond institutional practices and diversity management agendas (Hellgren, 2021). Yet, it is fundamental in the REPCAT project as well as in this article to consider these dimensions as closely interrelated: while structural inequalities may partly explain why few young people of disadvantaged backgrounds (many of whom have migrant or Roma origin) reach higher studies, more diversity among school teachers, police officers etc. could inspire more of these youngsters to continue their studies.

Regarding discursive representation of diversity in the Catalan police force, there are (at least) two central dimensions of how diversity is represented at the discursive level: whether the police force is presented as “diverse” or not, and if/how migration/diversity is included in the education material used for police aspirants at the Police Academy. The analysis of the

official website of the Catalan Police Force concludes that while there is information about how to report discrimination and hate crimes, and that the Catalan Police Force participates actively in prevention and awareness-raising on discrimination and hate crimes, there is no mention of (ethnic) diversity within the police force (The Catalan Police's website, accessed on 3 September, 2020<sup>1</sup>). The analysis of education material includes the comprehensive Study guide (*Guia d'estudi*), which constitutes the base for the access test to the Police Academy. It finds that, though interculturalism is the explicit foundation for the Catalan Government's approach to diversity, the term is not once mentioned in the Study guide. The section on diversity is limited to a short section (8 pages out of 250) on migration flows, immigration and integration policies in a "multicultural" society, in which emphasis lies on demographic data on immigration. There is also a short section about public policies for the equality of opportunities, in which only gender inequality is mentioned. Policies or norms against other forms of discrimination are not mentioned, nor is there, for instance, any discussion of what it means to perform police work in an ethnically diverse society. Consistent with the earlier work on diversity in the Catalan police force by Van Ewijk (2011), this study concludes that ethnic diversity is not given much salience and can hardly be considered a significant element of the Catalan police force's collective identity at present.

### *The political administration of Barcelona*

The diversity gap in politics and its consequences has been addressed by Ricard Zapata-Barrero (2017), who argues that lacking participation and representation of immigrants in politics constitute a democratic deficit that the parties will inevitably have to deal with. Parties, in turn, should be expected both to have an interest in increasing their internal diversity in order to better represent society and gain democratic legitimacy, and in order to attract immigrant voters (Zapata-Barrero, 2017). This standpoint appears particularly relevant in a pronouncedly interculturalist political context such as Catalonia in general, and the city of Barcelona in particular. Yet, just as in the education system and in the police force, the diversity gap is wide on the political scene of Barcelona. While the gender gap in politics has been much debated and addressed, the question of "ethnic equality" lags behind. 19 out of the 41 aldermen (*regidors*) representing all the political parties present in the City Council are currently women,

---

<sup>1</sup> [https://mossos.gencat.cat/ca/temes/odi\\_i\\_discriminacio/](https://mossos.gencat.cat/ca/temes/odi_i_discriminacio/)

but none are foreign-born or of another ethnicity than Spanish/Catalan (Barcelona City Council's website, accessed on 3 November, 2020<sup>2</sup>).

In order to increase the understanding of **what impact immigrant/ethnic minority politicians may have on diversity management**, three interviews conducted with minority members of political parties in Barcelona were illustrative. One of them states that she has struggled hard to place discrimination among her party's priorities. In her view, politically active immigrants have an important role to fill in creating awareness around this problem, which may be more difficult to identify with for people from the ethnic majority who do not share this experience.

“The general perception [in her party] is that these people [migrants in marginalized neighbourhoods] are not interested in political participation, but they are, it is just that they are afraid of being treated badly, or maybe they cannot attend the meetings at certain hours because they work cleaning houses or something.” M1, interview 2019

At the discursive level, interculturalism and an explicit pro-immigration and diversity agenda are salient in the policy documents defining the Barcelona City Council's policies within this field. Celebrating cultural diversity is part of the city's official identity, which has become yet more pronounced under the rule of major Ada Colau since 2015. Interculturalism as official approach to diversity management in the city of Barcelona however goes back to 2010, when the city was officially declared intercultural and adopted its Barcelona Interculturality Plan. There is a wide range of cultural and educational activities to combat racism and promote diversity at the municipal level, such as the extensive Anti-rumour program (Barcelona Interculturality Plan, 2010; Barcelona Anti-Rumour Strategy, 2019).

In this context, it is important to state that Catalan diversity management policies, while pronouncedly interculturalist, do not explicitly address the question of increased representation of diversity in different central spheres of society, as the public institutions, as a goal. During the policy evaluation conducted for the REPCAT project, it became clear that it is necessary to not only consider if and how an action has been implemented (Intercultural Cities, 2013), but indeed also **how the policy was formulated** to start with. Among the actions for intercultural policy implementation that were selected and evaluated in this report, there was one single action considered to address the question of increased participation/representation and thus, the

---

<sup>2</sup> <https://ajuntament.barcelona.cat/novaorganitzacio/es/>

potential for *institutional transformation*, if implemented successfully: “Affirmative actions in specific training programs intended to facilitate that people of immigrant origin compete on equal terms for access to public employment”. This action had however not been implemented, which according to the Secretariat for Equality, Migration and Citizenship was because of its dependence on the approval of a law that would allow foreign citizens to access public employment. It is at present not clear if, when or how this action will finally be implemented.

Several stakeholders that were interviewed for the REPCAT project argue that the implementation of intercultural policies at the level of the Barcelona City Council merely address the discursive dimension (interviews E10, M4, M7, M9), and that the effects of these policies are unclear. Nevertheless, the director of the Barcelona City Council’s Department for Citizenship Rights and Diversity, in charge of the city’s implementation of intercultural policies, emphasized the importance of precisely discourse in order to accomplish a change of mind. Similar to the Director of the Catalan Government’s Secretariat for Equality, Migration and Citizenship, with an equivalent task at the regional level, she argues that it is essential for the success of the intercultural project to make this a goal for the broad majority, and claims that “it is central how we communicate interculturalism to avoid being rejected by large segments of society” (meetings PM5 and PM6).

At the core of this debate lies a dilemma for interculturalism as political agenda: its endeavour to remain politically non-controversial in order to attract “everyone” may be contrary to the application of potentially controversial measures, for instance to combat economic inequalities that affect immigrants and racialized minorities disproportionately. Politicians in favour of interculturalism are aware of the risk of upsetting powerful actors as well as the broader public when considering potentially unpopular measures – as for instance quota systems against underrepresentation of ethnic diversity in public institutions (interviews M5-M10).

### ***3.2. Contrasting views on targeting and transformative measures***

This section approaches the question of what can be done in order to achieve the increased representation of ethnic diversity that the stakeholders agree is a priority for their institutions, at least at the discursive level. Referring to the famous concepts applied by Nancy Fraser (1995), a distinction can be made between targeting and transformative measures to address misrepresentation. As for targeting, the most typical forms of measures within this category would be different forms of positive action or quota systems (see, e.g., European Commission report, 2009).

When asked for their opinion about such measures, the stakeholders differed significantly between those who were firmly against any forms of “positive discrimination”, and those who considered them necessary, at least during a transitory stage that would normalize a higher degree of visible ethnic diversity in the public institutions. The **internal institutional discrepancies** are reflected by, for instance, comparing these quotes by respondents who both have high positions within the Catalan police force:

“I don’t think that positive discrimination is a good idea...it would be considered unfair by society in general, and it could lead to a questioning of the competence of those who would be recruited that way. It would take a political decision if it were to be applied, but in my opinion that will not happen. And quotas... that has not been discussed and I don’t think that it will be.”  
P3, interview 2019

“I believe that if we really have an important unbalance, we could apply these measures [affirmative action or quotas] to correct this unbalance. The tests would have to be the same for everyone, but we could make it easier for people from certain groups by offering them some help so that they can access these tests.” P5, interview 2019

These different attitudes towards if and how to address the lacking representation of diversity reflects a divide that appeared throughout the interviews (e.g. E1, E2, E3, P1, P2, P3, M1, M2, interviews 2019): whether a gradual transition towards greater diversity is expected to happen spontaneously, as a result of the growing ethnic pluralism in society as a whole, or whether one believes that specific measures are necessary in order to accomplish such a transition, at least temporarily.

Nearly all the interviewed representatives of the ethnic organizations firmly defended the quota system, and several stated that part of their agenda is to advocate for the implementation of some form of positive action.

“What we want is to place Roma people, and immigrants too but I speak for the Roma, in central positions of public representation, as in the police force and the education system. And in order to do that, they must meet the requirement in terms of qualifications, we cannot compromise on that. So if there are say 800 vacancies for police officers, 5 of these could be reserved for Roma people, that is what I propose. Nowadays, 5% of the places in all oppositions across Spain are reserved for disabled people, so some could also be reserved for ethnic diversity.” M5, interview 2019

“The political parties should apply a quota, 5% for immigrants. But they don’t want to do that. They’re scared. They can do it for women, but that’s different. But within the quota for women, they should state that so and so many should be of diverse origins, and for men, the same.” M9, interview 2019

Recurrent in the narratives by ethnic minority respondents with positions in public institutions or ethnic organizations is their emphasis on the need to mainstream diversity. A concrete example of what they refer to in practice was given during one of the sessions on diversity in the education system (meeting EM2). Overall, the families of Roma, Moroccan, Sub-Saharan African and Asian origin who participated in the meeting requested that they should be encouraged to participate in school activities, but not delegated educational responsibilities. They also agreed that many schools continue to reproduce stereotypical images of children with foreign backgrounds and their families that, despite good intentions, serve to stigmatize them and highlight their “difference”. What they want, they declared, is instead to be **allowed to form part of the mainstream**, a mainstream that needs to be constantly redefined. As one Roma father said, “it is very important for the ethnic communities to feel that we are included in the regular school curriculum and not just during a ‘culture week’” (meeting EM2). In a similar vein, school staff present at a follow-up meeting (meeting EM3) unanimously declared that they were tired of different “intercultural actions” that they considered inefficient in terms of achieving a more **normalized situation of interethnic conviviality** in schools: “Don’t impose more programs on us – what is needed is to mix the students, Catalans with Moroccans, and so on” (meeting EM3).

And this is where the question of transformative measures (Fraser, 1995) is clearly connected to the deep, structural inequalities that often prevent such mixing from taking place in practice. A transformative rather than targeting approach to the misrepresentation of ethnic diversity in public institutions would focus on addressing underlying inequalities at different levels, such as the disproportional school failure among students of immigrant and Roma origin, or the fact that the public schools are the ones dealing with the major part of ethnic diversity among pupils. This perspective addresses the structural problem preceding the idea of quotas or affirmative action: how to generate higher numbers of eligible minority aspirants, who could subsequently be recruited through such programs. Simultaneously, several of the respondents who advocate for positive action or quotas believe that an active recruitment of minority representatives would also contribute to transform the underlying structures of privilege vs. disadvantage. From this point of view, rather than being competing approaches to

misrepresentation, targeting and transformative measures may be seen as complementary means to achieve normalization or mainstreaming of diversity.

#### **4. Concluding remarks**

This paper has used some of the data collected for the REPCAT project to shed light on the barriers for increased representation of ethnic diversity in Catalan public institutions, and what potential there is for adopting targeting and transformative measures in order to address the current underrepresentation of diversity. The overall conclusion was that barriers are both related to structural inequalities and the absence of ethnic mainstreaming in the public institutions, despite an overall adherence to the intercultural agenda in official policies and guidelines. This in turn appears related to the fact that there is no efficient way to ensure that such policies and guidelines are being followed in practice, or that a majority of practitioners at different levels (for instance headmasters, individual teachers or police officers) are giving priority (or even support) to the intercultural perspective.

The stakeholder interviews conducted for the REPCAT project revealed unanimous support for the idea that ethnic diversity needs to be better represented in the public institutions of today's multiethnic Catalan society. Regarding how to achieve such representation, however, the opinions differed. It appears difficult to gain institutional support for targeting measures such as quotas or positive action, though such measures are overall promoted by the ethnic organizations.

I have earlier argued that there is an implicit, politically contentious dimension of the intercultural agenda (Hellgren, 2019b), in that it presupposes egalitarian interethnic relations and non-segregation (Zapata-Barrero, 2019). This is evident, for instance, in Zapata-Barrero's (2019) definition of the basic criteria for an "intercultural citizenship". In evaluating the representation of diversity in Catalonia, it appears that this dimension constitutes an Achilles' heel: in the endeavour to avoid controversies and bring the vast majority of society on board as part of the "intercultural project", its desired transformative impact becomes harder to achieve.

## Bibliographical references

- Arnesen, S. & Peters, Y. (2017). The legitimacy of representation: How descriptive, formal and responsiveness representation affect the acceptability of political decisions. *Comparative Political Studies*, 51(7), 868-899.
- Aspers, P. (2011). *Etnografiska metoder*. Helsingborg: Liber.
- Barcelona Interculturality Plan (2010). Barcelona City Council: [https://ajuntament.barcelona.cat/bcnacciointercultural/sites/default/files/documentos/web\\_bcn\\_angles.pdf](https://ajuntament.barcelona.cat/bcnacciointercultural/sites/default/files/documentos/web_bcn_angles.pdf).
- Barcelona Anti-Rumour Strategy (2019). Barcelona City Council: <https://ajuntament.barcelona.cat/bcnacciointercultural/ca/estrategia-bcn-antirumors/xarxabcnantirumors>
- Bell, M. (2002). *Anti-Discrimination Law and the European Union*. Oxford: Oxford Studies in European Law.
- Benhabib, S. (2002). *The Claims of Culture: Equality and Diversity in the Global Era*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Bereményi, B. A. & Carrasco, S. (2015). Interrupted Aspirations: Research and Policy on Gitano Education in a Time of Recession, in Spain. *Intercultural Education*, 26(1), 1–12.
- Bereményi, B. A. & Carrasco, S. (2017). Bittersweet success. The impact of academic achievement among the Spanish Roma after a decade of Roma inclusion. In Pink, W. and Noblit, W. eds. *Second International Handbook on Urban Education (1169–1198)*. New York: Springer.
- Bayona, J. & Domingo, A. (2018). El fracaso escolar de los descendientes de la inmigración en Cataluña: más que una asignatura pendiente. Working paper 11/2018, Centre d'Estudis Demogràfics, Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona: [https://ced.uab.cat/PD/PerspectivesDemografiques\\_011\\_ESP.pdf](https://ced.uab.cat/PD/PerspectivesDemografiques_011_ESP.pdf)
- Bhabha, H. K. (1994). *The location of culture*. London and New York: Routledge.



- Bousetta, H. and Modood, T. (2001) Anti-Discrimination Good Practice Guide. Report on the EU Anti-discrimination directive from Eurocities Anti-discrimination Exchange. [http://www.tariqmodood.com/uploads/1/2/3/9/12392325/anti\\_discrimination.pdf](http://www.tariqmodood.com/uploads/1/2/3/9/12392325/anti_discrimination.pdf)
- Catalan Government (2007). DOGC (Diari Oficial de la Generalitat de Catalunya) 4890-24/05/2007: [https://dogc.gencat.cat/es/pdogc\\_canals\\_interns/pdogc\\_sumari\\_del\\_dogc/?anexos=1&selectedYear=2007&selectedMonth=4&numDOGC=4890&language=es\\_ES](https://dogc.gencat.cat/es/pdogc_canals_interns/pdogc_sumari_del_dogc/?anexos=1&selectedYear=2007&selectedMonth=4&numDOGC=4890&language=es_ES)
- Catalan integration report (2016). Integration of immigrants in Catalonia 2015. [https://treballiaferssocials.gencat.cat/web/.content/03ambits\\_tematicas/05immigracio\\_refugi/dades\\_immigracio/informe\\_integracio/2015/Informe-integracio-immigracio-2015.pdf](https://treballiaferssocials.gencat.cat/web/.content/03ambits_tematicas/05immigracio_refugi/dades_immigracio/informe_integracio/2015/Informe-integracio-immigracio-2015.pdf)
- Catalan Government (2017). Citizenship and Migration plan 2017-2020. [http://treballiaferssocials.gencat.cat/web/.content/01departament/08publicacions/ambits\\_tematicas/immigracio/Plans\\_i\\_programes/06plainmigracio\\_cat\\_2017\\_2020/Pla\\_inmigracioue\\_CAT\\_OK.pdf](http://treballiaferssocials.gencat.cat/web/.content/01departament/08publicacions/ambits_tematicas/immigracio/Plans_i_programes/06plainmigracio_cat_2017_2020/Pla_inmigracioue_CAT_OK.pdf)
- Charmaz, K. (2000). Grounded theory: Objectivist and constructivist methods, in Denzin, N. & Lincoln, Y. eds., *Handbook of qualitative research* (509–535). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Crenshaw, K. (1991). Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity Politics, and Violence against Women of Color. *Stanford Law Review*, 43(6), 1241-1299.
- Cretton, V. (2017). Performing Whiteness: Racism, Skin Colour, and Identity in Western Switzerland. *Ethnic and Racial Studies* doi:10.1080/01419870.2017.1312006
- ENAR (European Network Against Racism) shadow report 2013-2017 (2017). Racism and Discrimination in Employment in Europe. [https://www.enar-eu.org/IMG/pdf/shadowreport\\_2016x2017\\_long\\_final\\_lowres.pdf](https://www.enar-eu.org/IMG/pdf/shadowreport_2016x2017_long_final_lowres.pdf)
- European Commission report (2009). International perspectives on positive action measures. A comparative analysis in the European Union, Canada, the United States and South Africa: <https://op.europa.eu/en/publication-detail/-/publication/45515983-3e3e-4a24-bcbc-477f04f0ba04>

- Fraser, N. (1995). From Redistribution to Recognition? Dilemmas of Justice in a Post-Socialist Age. *New Left Review* I/212, July-August 1995.
- Gans, H. J. (2017). Racialization and Racialization Research. *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 40(3), 341–352.
- Geddes, A. (2004). Britain, France, and EU Anti-Discrimination Policy: The Emergence of an EU Policy Paradigm. *West European Politics*, 27(2), 334-353.
- Hellgren, Z. (2021). REPCAT. The Role of the Ethnic Majority in Integration Processes: Attitudes and Practices towards Immigrants in Catalan Institutions. Final project report. DOI 10.13140/RG.2.2.22344.24320
- Hellgren, Z. & Gabrielli, L. (2021). Racialization and Aporophobia: Intersecting Discriminations in the Experiences of Non-Western Migrants and Spanish Roma. *Social Sciences*, 10(5). <https://doi.org/10.3390/socsci10050163>
- Hellgren, Z. (2019a). Class, race - and place: Immigrants' self-perceptions on inclusion, belonging and opportunities in Stockholm and Barcelona. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 42(12), 2084-2102.
- Hellgren, Z. (2019b). Book review: Intercultural citizenship in the post-multicultural era by Ricard Zapata-Barrero. *Ethnic and Racial Studies* <https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870.2019.1696466>
- Hellgren, Z. (2016). Immigrant Integration as a Two-Way Process: Stakeholder discourses and practices in Stockholm and Barcelona. *Psychosociological Issues in Human Resource Management* 4(1), 143-167.
- Hine, D., Keaton, D. & Small, S. (2009). *Black Europe and the African Diaspora*. Chicago: University of Illinois.
- Horst, C. & Gitz-Johansen, T. (2010). Education of ethnic minority children in Denmark: monocultural hegemony and counter positions. *Intercultural Education* 21(2), 137-151.
- Hänni, M. (2017). Presence, representation, and impact: how minority MPs affect policy outcomes. *Legislative Studies Quarterly*, 42(1), 97–130.

- Intercultural Cities (2013). Evaluating the performance and impact of intercultural policies. Workshop paper: <https://rm.coe.int/16803009be>
- Kroeber, C. (2018). How to measure the substantive representation of traditionally excluded groups in comparative research: a literature review and new data. *Representation. Journal of Representative Democracy*, 54(3), 241-259.
- Lentin, A. (2020) *Why Race Still Matters*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Lentin, A. (2011). *Racism and Ethnic Discrimination*, New York: Rosen Publishing.
- Lentin, A. (2008). Europe and the Silence about Race. *European Journal of Social Theory*, 11(4), 487–503.
- Longman, C. & De Graeve, K. (2014). From happy to critical diversity: intersectionality as a paradigm for gender and diversity research. *Journal of Diversity and Gender Studies*, 1(1), 33-39.
- Lödén, H. (2008). Swedish: Being or Becoming? Immigration, National Identity and the Democratic State. *International Journal of the Social Sciences*, 3(4), 257-264.
- Maneri, M. (2020). Breaking the race taboo in a besieged Europe: how photographs of the “refugee crisis” reproduce racialized hierarchy. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, <https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870.2020.1723672>
- Martín Criado, E. (2018). Juventud y educación: cuestión de clase. *Encrucijadas: Revista Crítica de Ciencias Sociales*, nº 15. <http://www.encrucijadas.org/index.php/ojs/article/view/430>
- McIntyre, A. (2008). *Participatory Action Research*. London: Sage.
- Mills, J., Bonner, A. & Francis, K. (2006). The Development of Constructivist Grounded Theory. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 5(1), 25-35.
- Moreno, S. & Alòs, R. (2015). La inmigración en España: ¿Una integración con pies de barro? *Política y Sociedad*, 53(2), 509-528.
- Miskovic, M. (2009). Roma education in Europe: in support of the discourse of race. *Pedagogy, Culture & Society*, 17(2), 201-220.

- Modood, T. (2011). Multiculturalism and Integration. Struggling with Confusions. Research report, European University Institute Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies; ACCEPT PLURALISM 7th Framework Programme Project: <https://www.coe.int/t/dg4/cultureheritage/mars/source/resources/references/others/38%20-%20Multiculturalisme%20and%20Integration%20-%20Modood%202011.pdf>
- O'Hanlon, C. (2016). The European Struggle to Educate and Include Roma People: A Critique of Differences in Policy and Practice in Western and Eastern EU Countries. *Social Inclusion*, 4(1), 1-10.
- Paniagua, A. & Bereményi, B. A. (2019). Legitimising inequality? The governance of 'Others' through participatory initiatives in schools. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 49(1), 115-131.
- Parekh, B. (2000). *Rethinking Multiculturalism. Cultural Diversity and Political Theory*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Penninx, R. & Garces-Mascareñas, B. (2016). The Concept of Integration as an Analytical Tool and as a Policy Concept. In *Integration Processes and Policies in Europe*, Springer: IMISCOE Research Series.
- Rodríguez-García, D., Solana, M., Ortiz, A. & Ballestín, B. (2019). Blurring of color lines? Ethnoracially mixed youth in Spain navigating identity. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, DOI: 10.1080/1369183X.2019.1654157
- Study guide (Guia d'estudi) (2019). Educational material for access to the category of police officer. Generalitat de Catalunya. Departament d'Interior: [https://mossos.gencat.cat/web/.content/home/01\\_els\\_mossos\\_desquadra/ingresCos/Esca labAsica/46\\_19\\_mossoa\\_2019/02\\_guia/Guiamossos\\_web\\_2019.pdf](https://mossos.gencat.cat/web/.content/home/01_els_mossos_desquadra/ingresCos/Esca labAsica/46_19_mossoa_2019/02_guia/Guiamossos_web_2019.pdf)
- Telles, E. (2014). *Pigmentocracies. Ethnicity, Race, and Color in Latin America*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press
- Thornton Dill, B. & Zinn, M. B. (1996). Theorizing Difference from Multiracial Feminism. *Feminist Studies*, 22(2): 321-331.

- Van Dijk, T. (2016). Discourse and Racism: Some Conclusions of 30 years of Research. In Capone, A. & Mey, J. (eds.). *Interdisciplinary Studies in Pragmatics, Culture and Society*. Cham: Springer: 285-297
- Van Ewijk, A. (2011a). *Diversity in uniform*. Doctoral thesis, Pompeu Fabra University.
- Van Ewijk, A. (2011b). Diversity within police forces in Europe: A case for the comprehensive view. *Policing: A Journal of Policy and Practice*, 6 (1), 76-92.
- Vertovec, S. (2019). Talking around super-diversity. *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 42(1), 125-139.
- Vertovec, S. (2007). Super-diversity and its implications. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*. 30(6), 1024–1054.
- Wu, Z., Shimmele, C. M. & Ho, F. (2012). Self-Perceived Integration of Immigrants and Their Children. *The Canadian Journal of Sociology* 37(4), 381–408.
- Yuval-Davis, N. (2007). Intersectionality, Citizenship and Contemporary Politics of Belonging. *Critical Review of International Social and Political Philosophy*, 10(4), 561-574.
- Zapata-Barrero, R. (2017). The Intercultural Turn in Europe: Process of Policy Paradigm Change and Formation. In *Interculturalism at the Crossroads: Comparative Perspectives on Concepts, Policies and Practices*, ed. Mansouri, F. Paris: UNESCO Publishing
- Zapata-Barrero, R. (2019). *Intercultural Citizenship in the Post-Multicultural Era*. London: SAGE Publications Ltd.

## Annex I: List of interview persons

<b>Respondent ID</b>	<b>Interview conducted in</b>	<b>Characteristics of the respondent</b>
P1	Mollet del Vallès, 2019	Female, Catalan, head of unit at the Catalan Police Academy
P2	Mollet del Vallès, 2019	Female, Catalan, responsible for content of the official Catalan police training program
P3	Barcelona, 2019	Male, Catalan, inspector within the General Catalan Police Direction
P4	Barcelona, 2020	Male, Catalan, sergeant at police station in central Barcelona
P5	Barcelona, 2020	Male, Catalan, inspector at police office in small Catalan city
P6	Mollet del Vallès, 2020	Female, Guinean-Spanish, police officer in Barcelona
P7	Barcelona, 2020	Male, Moroccan origin, police officer in Barcelona
P8	Barcelona, 2019	Female, Bolivian origin, police aspirant
P9	Barcelona, 2019	Female, Colombian origin, police aspirant
P10	Barcelona, 2019	Male, Colombian origin, police aspirant
P11	Mollet del Vallès, 2019	Male, Catalan, police officer
E1	Barcelona, 2018	Female, Catalan, sub-director at Department of Education
E2	Barcelona, 2018	Male, Catalan, section leader, Department of Education
E3	Barcelona, 2019	Female, Catalan, section leader, Department of Education
E4	Barcelona, 2019	Female, Catalan, headmaster at public school, Barcelona
E5	Barcelona, 2019	Female, Catalan, headmaster at public school, Barcelona
E6	Barcelona, 2019	Male, British, teacher at semi-private school, Barcelona
E7	Barcelona, 2019	Male, Catalan, teacher at public school, Barcelona
E8	Barcelona, 2019	Female, Catalan, teacher at semi-private school, Barcelona
E9	Barcelona, 2019	Female, Catalan, head of pedagogics department at Catalan university
E10	Barcelona, 2019	Male, Catalan, diversity scholar and member of department direction at Catalan university
E11	Barcelona, 2018	Female, Roma, teacher program student at Catalan university
M1	Barcelona, 2019	Female, Uruguayan origin, member of political party
M2	Barcelona, 2019	Male, Colombian origin, member of political party
M3	Barcelona, 2020	Male, Congolese origin, member of political party
M4	Barcelona, 2020	Female, Guinean origin, public officer
M5	Barcelona, 2019	Male, Roma, leader of Roma organization
M6	Barcelona, 2020	Male, Roma, leader of Roma youth association
M7	Barcelona, 2020	Male, Argentine, leader of immigrant organization
M8	Barcelona, 2019	Male, Guinean origin, PhD student and leader of intercultural association
M9	Barcelona, 2019	Male, Pakistani origin, leader of immigrant organization
M10	Barcelona, 2019	Female, Moroccan origin, leader of women's organization
M11	Barcelona, 2019	Male, Romanian origin, leader of ethnic organization

## Annex II: List of meetings where participant observations were conducted

Meeting ID	Title of the meeting	Date and place
EM 1	“El tractament de la diversitat als llibres de text” (The treatment of diversity in text books)	5 Dec 2018, Fundació Acsar, Barcelona
EM 2	“La educació intercultural en diàleg–qué en pensen les famílies?” (Intercultural education in dialogue–what do the families think?)	6 March 2019, Espai Avinyó, Barcelona
EM 3	“Més enllà de l’aula” (Beyond the classroom). Research seminar on school failure among immigrant students.	29 May 2019, Espai Avinyó, Barcelona
EM 4	“La educació intercultural en diàleg–qué en pensen els i les mestres?” (Intercultural education in dialogue–what do the teachers think?)	13 June 2019, Espai Avinyó, Barcelona
EM 5	“Jornada de lengua y cultures de origen” (Session about origin languages and cultures), Conference about the Plurilinguisme program of the Catalan Department of Education	17 May 2019, Departament d’Ensenyament UPF, Barcelona
EM 6	“La educació intercultural en diàleg–qué en pensen els i les alumnes?” (Intercultural education in dialogue–what do the pupils think?)	20 February 2020, Espai Avinyó, Barcelona
PM 1	”La construcció del sentit de pertinença dels joves fills de famílies immigrades” (The construction of belonging among children of immigrants), Innovation Camp. Participation as stakeholder: <a href="https://www.upf.edu/web/gritim/news/-/asset_publisher/GcIdyAQFCyDE/content/id/230058068/maximized#.X41VHsIza70">https://www.upf.edu/web/gritim/news/-/asset_publisher/GcIdyAQFCyDE/content/id/230058068/maximized#.X41VHsIza70</a>	23-24 October 2019, Generalitat de Catalunya
PM 2	“For an intercultural future” Seminar series, stakeholder seminar 1: Immigration politics: challenges, objectives and tools.	9 October 2019 Organized by Fundació Catalunya Europa, Fundació La Caixa, The Club of Rome, with support by Generalitat de Catalunya and Ajuntament de Barcelona
PM 3	“For an intercultural future” Seminar series, stakeholder seminar 2: Public management from an intercultural perspective.	19 November 2019, Organized by Fundació Catalunya Europa, Fundació La Caixa, The Club of Rome, with support by Generalitat de

		Catalunya and Ajuntament de Barcelona
PM 4	“For an intercultural future” Seminar series, stakeholder seminar 3: Equity, Equality and Non-discrimination.	24 January 2020, Organized by Fundació Catalunya Europa, Fundació La Caixa, The Club of Rome, with support by Generalitat de Catalunya and Ajuntament de Barcelona
PM 5	National Pact for Interculturalism by Generalitat de Catalunya (official presentation).	14 November 2020, Generalitat de Catalunya
PM 6	Re-SOMA-GRITIM transnational seminar 31 January 2020: Interculturalism and Migration Observatories; Evidences, policy approaches and social ties.	31 January 2020, Generalitat de Catalunya
PM 7	Debate on education in Catalonia between Miquel Essomba and Zenia Hellgren: <a href="https://www.upf.edu/web/gritim/news/-/asset_publisher/GcIdyAQFCyDE/content/id/232885077/maximized#.X41VhMIza70">https://www.upf.edu/web/gritim/news/-/asset_publisher/GcIdyAQFCyDE/content/id/232885077/maximized#.X41VhMIza70</a> , See also the video recording: <a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YBpcK4bB9fo">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YBpcK4bB9fo</a>	27 February, 2020, Pompeu Fabra University